

In Re Public Meeting NYC - Mayor`s Office of Contract Services
(MOCS)

June 8, 2022

1 -----X

2 PUBLIC MEETING

3 FRANCHISE AND CONCESSION REVIEW COMMITTEE

4 -----X

5 Held Remotely
6 Via Microsoft Teams

7 June 8, 2022
8 2:35 p.m.

8

9

10 PUBLIC MEETING in the above-referenced
11 matter, held via video conference at the above time,
12 before Sabrina Brown Stewart, a Notary Public of the
13 State of New York.

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

In Re Public Meeting NYC - Mayor`s Office of Contract Services
(MOCS)

June 8, 2022

2

1 A P P E A R A N C E S:

2

3 Chair/Mayor:
4 ALLISON STODDART

5 Clerk:
6 GREGG ALLEYNE

7 Associate General Counsel:
8 ALEXANDRE STAMOULIS

9 Office of Management and Budget:
10 YVONNE QUINTIAN

11 Office of the Mayor:
12 RAHUL AGARWAL

13 Corporation Counsel:
14 KENISHA SUTTON

15 Comptroller:
16 JOHN KATSORHIS

17 Borough President of Bronx:
18 MIRTHA CAMILLE SABIO

19 Borough President of Brooklyn:
20 JOHN DOUGLAS

21 Borough President of Manhattan:
22 AYA KEEFE

23 Borough President of Queens:
24 ALLAN SWISHER

25 Borough President of Staten Island:
LAUREN LEFKOWITZ

In Re Public Meeting NYC - Mayor`s Office of Contract Services
(MOCS)

June 8, 2022

3

1 MR. ALLEYNE: Hello, everyone. This is
2 Gregg Alleyne, the Clerk for the FCRC.

3 Before we get started with today's
4 proceedings, I'd like to confirm that
5 everyone can hear me clearly.

6 Can everyone hear me clearly?

7 (Chorus of yeses.)

8 MR. ALLEYNE: Today's meeting is being
9 held via Microsoft Teams conference call.
10 And we ask that all attendees announce their
11 name for the record each time they speak on
12 the call for ease of transcription.

13 If you're not speaking, we ask that you
14 mute your microphone to avoid background
15 noises during the call.

16 Only one person should be speaking at
17 any given time. Either Alex or I will
18 direct, should there be any conflict.

19 Chair, we are ready to begin.

20 MS. STODDART: Thank you, Gregg.

21 This is Allison Stoddart. Good
22 afternoon and thank you all for being here.
23 My name is Allison Stoddart, Chair for the
24 FCRC.

25 The Franchise and Concession Review

In Re Public Meeting NYC - Mayor's Office of Contract Services
(MOCS)

June 8, 2022

4

1 Committee Remote Public Meeting will now come
2 to order.

3 Will the Clerk please call the roll?

4 MR. ALLEYNE: This is Gregg Alleyne,
5 the Clerk.

6 Mayor?

7 MS. STODDART: Allison Stoddart,
8 present.

9 MR. ALLEYNE: Office of the Mayor?

10 MR. AGARWAL: Rahul Agarwal, present.

11 MR. ALLEYNE: Comptroller?

12 MR. KATSORHIS: John Katsorhis,
13 present.

14 MR. ALLEYNE: Corporation Counsel?

15 MS. SUTTON: Kenisha Sutton, present.

16 MR. ALLEYNE: Office of Management and
17 Budget?

18 MS. QUINTIAN: Yvonne Quintian,
19 present.

20 MR. ALLEYNE: President, Borough of the
21 Bronx?

22 MS. SABIO: Mirtha Sabio for Bronx
23 Borough President Vanessa L. Gibson.

24 MR. ALLEYNE: President, Borough of
25 Brooklyn?

In Re Public Meeting NYC - Mayor's Office of Contract Services
(MOCS)

June 8, 2022

5

1 MR. DOUGLAS: John Douglas, Brooklyn
2 Borough President, here.

3 MR. ALLEYNE: President, Borough of
4 Manhattan?

5 MS. KEEFE: Aya Keefe for Manhattan
6 Borough President Mark Levine.

7 MR. ALLEYNE: President, Borough of
8 Queens?

9 MR. SWISHER: Allan Swisher for Queens
10 Borough President Donovan Richards.

11 MR. ALLEYNE: President, Borough of
12 Staten Island?

13 MS. LEFKOWITZ: Lauren Lefkowitz,
14 Staten Island Borough President Vito
15 Fossella.

16 MS. STODDART: Thank you. This is
17 Allison Stoddart.

18 Will the Clerk please call the first
19 calendar item?

20 MR. ALLEYNE: Gregg Alleyne, Clerk.

21 New York City Department of
22 Transportation, Calendar Item Number 1:

23 In the matter of the intent to seek
24 Franchise and Concession Review Committee
25 approval regarding a proposed amendment to a

June 8, 2022

6

1 common carrier bus service franchise
2 agreement between the City of New York and
3 Private Transportation Corporation, that
4 will, among other things, raise the
5 franchisee's uniform maximum fare.

6 Please be advised that at the request
7 of the agency, this item will be held over to
8 the July 13th FCRC Public Meeting.

9 MS. STODDART: Thank you.

10 Will the Clerk please call the next
11 calendar item?

12 MR. ALLEYNE: New York City Department
13 of Parks and Recreation, Calendar Item
14 Number 2: In the matter of the intent to
15 seek Franchise and Concession Review
16 Committee approval, pursuant to Section 1-16
17 of the Concession Rules of the City of
18 New York, to utilize a different procedure to
19 enter into a concession agreement with Row
20 New York Inc., for the use, maintenance and
21 operation of rowing facilities at Sherman
22 Creek, Manhattan, for a 20-year term.

23 Please be advised that at the request
24 of the agency, this item will be held over to
25 the July 13th FCRC Public Meeting.

June 8, 2022

7

1 MS. STODDART: Thank you.

2 Will the Clerk please call the next
3 calendar item?

4 MR. ALLEYNE: New York City Department
5 of Parks and Recreation, Calendar Item
6 Number 3: In the matter of the intent to
7 seek Franchise and Concession Review
8 Committee approval, pursuant to Section 1-16
9 of the Concession Rules of the City of
10 New York, to utilize a different procedure to
11 enter into a concession agreement with The
12 Alliance Downtown New York, Inc., for the
13 operation, management and maintenance of an
14 outdoor café at Coenties Slip Park and the
15 maintenance of Coenties Slip Park, Manhattan.

16 Please be advised that at the request
17 of the agency, this item will be held over to
18 the July 13th FCRC Public Meeting.

19 MS. STODDART: Thank you.

20 Will the Clerk please call the next
21 calendar item?

22 MR. ALLEYNE: New York City Department
23 Of Citywide Administrative Services, Calendar
24 Item Number 4: In the matter of the intent
25 to seek Franchise and Concession Review

June 8, 2022

8

1 Committee approval, pursuant to Section 1-16
2 of the Concession Rules of the City of
3 New York, to utilize a different procedure,
4 to negotiate a sole source occupancy permit
5 with Emmons Avenue Marina, LLC, to utilize
6 City-owned waterfront property, also known as
7 Block 8844, Lot 50, Borough of Brooklyn, for
8 dry boat storage, docking of no more than
9 eight jet skis, and business accessory
10 parking.

11 MS. STODDART: Thank you. This is
12 Allison Stoddart.

13 Is there a member who wishes to make a
14 statement or ask a question on this matter?

15 (No response).

16 MS. STODDART: If not, will a member
17 please make a motion to move this item?

18 MS. SUTTON: Kenisha Sutton, I move
19 this item.

20 MS. STODDART: Will another member
21 please second the motion?

22 MR. AGARWAL: Rahul Agarwal, I second.

23 MS. STODDART: Will the Clerk please
24 take the vote.

25 MR. ALLEYNE: Gregg Alleyne, Clerk.

In Re Public Meeting NYC - Mayor's Office of Contract Services
(MOCS)

June 8, 2022

9

1 Mayor?

2 MS. STODDART: Allison Stoddart, yes.

3 MR. ALLEYNE: Office of the Mayor?

4 MR. AGARWAL: Rahul Agarwal, yes.

5 MR. ALLEYNE: Comptroller?

6 MR. KATSORHIS: John Katsorhis, yes.

7 MR. ALLEYNE: Corporation Counsel?

8 MS. SUTTON: Kenisha Sutton, yes.

9 MR. ALLEYNE: Office of Management and
10 Budget?

11 MS. QUINTIAN: Yvonne Quintian, yes.

12 MR. ALLEYNE: On behalf of the Borough
13 Presidents, president, Borough of Brooklyn?

14 MR. DOUGLAS: John Douglas, yes.

15 MR. ALLEYNE: Calendar Item Number 4,
16 Resolution is: Adopted.

17 MS. STODDART: Thank you.

18 Will the Clerk please call the next
19 calendar item?

20 MR. ALLEYNE: New York City Department
21 of Records and Information Services, Calendar
22 Item Number 5: In the matter of the intent
23 to seek Franchise and Concession Review
24 Committee approval, pursuant to Section 1-16
25 of the Concession Rules of the City of

June 8, 2022

10

1 New York, to utilize a different procedure,
2 to negotiate a sole source concession
3 agreement with Ancestry.com Operations, Inc.,
4 for the digitization, indexing and internet
5 publication and hosting of selected
6 historical records.

7 MS. STODDART: This is Allison
8 Stoddart.

9 Is there a member who wishes to make a
10 statement or ask a question on this matter?

11 (No response).

12 MS. STODDART: If not, will a member
13 please make a motion to move this item?

14 MS. SUTTON: Kenisha Sutton, I move
15 this item.

16 MS. STODDART: Will another member
17 please second the motion?

18 MR. AGARWAL: Rahul Agarwal, I second.

19 MS. STODDART: Will the Clerk please
20 take the vote.

21 MR. ALLEYNE: Mayor?

22 MS. STODDART: Allison Stoddart, yes.

23 MR. ALLEYNE: Office of the Mayor?

24 MR. AGARWAL: Rahul Agarwal, yes.

25 MR. ALLEYNE: Comptroller?

In Re Public Meeting NYC - Mayor`s Office of Contract Services
(MOCS)

June 8, 2022

11

1 MR. KATSORHIS: John Katsorhis, yes.

2 MR. ALLEYNE: Corporation Counsel?

3 MS. SUTTON: Kenisha Sutton, yes.

4 MR. ALLEYNE: Office of Management and
5 Budget?

6 MS. QUINTIAN: Yvonne Quintian, yes.

7 MR. ALLEYNE: On behalf of the Borough
8 Presidents, president, Borough of Brooklyn?

9 MR. DOUGLAS: John Douglas, yes.

10 MR. ALLEYNE: Calendar Item Number 5,
11 Resolution is: Adopted.

12 We ask that the reporter make the
13 entire remote public meeting agenda, which
14 was made publicly available and distributed
15 at this meeting, part of the final record of
16 this proceeding.

17 That completes the calendar.

18 MS. STODDART: This is Allison
19 Stoddart. Before I adjourn the meeting, I
20 just want to say thank you to Gregg Alleyne,
21 our Clerk, for serving as the FCRC clerk.

22 He is moving on from this role to
23 serve, continue serving, in city service at
24 the Department of Health and Mental Hygiene.
25 So, I just want to say thank you to Gregg.

June 8, 2022

12

1 And that's it. So, this meeting is
2 adjourned.

3 MR. ALLEYNE: Thank you. Thank you,
4 very much, Allison.

5 And I'd like to say it was a pleasure
6 working with everyone on the Committee, and
7 thank you all for all of your help.

8 Thank you.

9 (Chorus of thank yous to Gregg.)

10 MR. ALLEYNE: Have a great year. I
11 really appreciate everyone. I wish this
12 could have been in person.

13 (TIME NOTED: 2:44 p.m.)

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

June 8, 2022

13

C E R T I F I C A T E

STATE OF NEW YORK)

:SS

COUNTY OF QUEENS)

I, Sabrina Brown Stewart, a shorthand reporter within and for the State of New York, do hereby certify that the within is a true and accurate transcript of the statement taken on June 8, 2022.

I further certify that I am not related to any of the parties to this action by blood or by marriage, and that I am in no way interested in the outcome of this matter.

IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have hereunto set my hand this 16th day of June 2022.

Sabrina Brown Stewart
Sabrina Brown Stewart

**In Re Public Meeting NYC - Mayor`s Office of Contract Services
(MOCS)**

June 8, 2022

14

13th 6:8,25 7:18	3:1,2,8 4:4,4,9,11,14,16,20,24	aya 2:17 5:5	call 3:9,12,15 4:3 5:18 6:10 7:2,20 9:18 (9)	7:7,9,11,25 8:2 9:23,25 10:2 (14)
16th 13:17	5:3,7,11,20,20 6:12 7:4,22	background 3:14		conference 1:11 3:9
20year 6:22	8:25,25 9:3,5,7,9,12,15,20	before 1:12 3:3 11:19	camille 2:14	confirm 3:4
above 1:11	10:21,23,25 11:2,4,7,10,20	begin 3:19	can 3:5,6	conflict 3:18
abovereferenced 1:10	12:3,10 (39)	behalf 9:12 11:7	carrier 6:1	continue 11:23
accessory 8:9	alliance 7:12	being 3:8,22	certify 13:9,12	corporation 2:10 4:14 6:3 9:7 11:2 (5)
accurate 13:10	allison 2:3 3:21,23 4:7 5:17 8:12 9:2 10:7,22 11:18 12:4 (11)	between 6:2	chair 3:19,23	could 12:12
action 13:13		block 8:7	chairmayor 2:3	counsel 2:6,10 4:14 9:7 11:2 (5)
adjourn 11:19	also 8:6	blood 13:13	chorus 3:7 12:9	county 13:5
adjourned 12:2	am 13:12,14	boat 8:8	city 5:21 6:2,12,17 7:4,9,22 8:2 9:20,25 11:23 (11)	creek 6:22
administrative 7:23	amendment 5:25	borough 2:13,15,16,18,19 4:20,23,24 5:2,3,6,7,10,11,14 8:7 9:12,13 11:7,8 (20)	cityowned 8:6	day 13:17
adopted 9:16 11:11	among 6:4		citywide 7:23	department 5:21 6:12 7:4,22 9:20 11:24 (6)
advised 6:6,23 7:16	ancestrycom 10:3	bronx 2:13 4:21,22	clearly 3:5,6	different 6:18 7:10 8:3 10:1 (4)
afternoon 3:22	announce 3:10	brooklyn 2:15 4:25 5:1 8:7 9:13 11:8 (6)	clerk 2:4 3:2 4:3,5 5:18,20 6:10 7:2,20 8:23,25 9:18 10:19 11:21,21 (15)	digitization 10:4
agarwal 2:9 4:10,10 8:22,22 9:4,4 10:18,18,24,24 (11)	another 8:20 10:16	brown 1:12 13:7	coenties 7:14,15	direct 3:18
agency 6:7,24 7:17	approval 5:25 6:16 7:8 8:1 9:24 (5)	budget 2:7 4:17 9:10 11:5 (4)	come 4:1	distributed 11:14
agenda 11:13	are 3:19	bus 6:1	committee 1:3 4:1 5:24 6:16 7:8 8:1 9:24 12:6 (8)	docking 8:8
agreement 6:2,19 7:11 10:3 (4)	ask 3:10,13 8:14 10:10 11:12 (5)	business 8:9	common 6:1	donovan 5:10
alex 3:17	associate 2:6	c 2:1 13:1,1	completes 11:17	douglas 2:15 5:1,1 9:14,14 11:9,9 (7)
alexandre 2:6	attendees 3:10	café 7:14	comptroller 2:12 4:11 9:5 10:25 (4)	downtown 7:12
allan 2:18 5:9	available 11:14	calendar 5:19,22 6:11,13 7:3,5,21,23 9:15,19,21 11:10,17 (13)	concession 1:3 3:25 5:24 6:15,17,19	dry 8:8
alleyne 2:5	avenue 8:5			during 3:15
	avoid 3:14			

**In Re Public Meeting NYC - Mayor`s Office of Contract Services
(MOCS)**

June 8, 2022

15

e 2:1,1 13:1,1 (4)	gregg 2:5 3:2,20 4:4 5:20 8:25 11:20,25 12:9 (9)	island 2:19 5:12,14	make 8:13,17 10:9,13 11:12 (5)	moving 11:22
each 3:11		item 5:19,22 6:7,11,13,24 7:3,5,17,21,24	management 2:7 4:16 7:13 9:9 11:4 (5)	ms 3:20 4:7,15,18,22 5:5,13,16 6:9 7:1,19
ease 3:12	hand 13:17	8:17,19 9:15,19,22 10:13,15 11:10 (19)	manhattan 2:16 5:4,5 6:22 7:15 (5)	8:11,16,18,20,23 9:2,8,11,17 10:7,1 2,14,16,19,22 11:3,6,18 (29)
eight 8:9	he 11:22	jet 8:9	marina 8:5	much 12:4
either 3:17	health 11:24	john 2:12,15 4:12 5:1 9:6,14 11:1,9 (8)	mark 5:6	mute 3:14
emmons 8:5	hear 3:5,6	july 6:8,25 7:18	marriage 13:14	my 3:23 13:16
enter 6:19 7:11	held 1:5,11 3:9 6:7,24 7:17 (6)	june 13:11,17	matter 1:11 5:23 6:14 7:6,24 8:14 9:22 10:10 13:15 (9)	n 2:1
entire 11:13	hello 3:1	just 11:20,25	maximum 6:5	name 3:11,23
everyone 3:1,5,6 12:6,11 (5)	help 12:7	katsorhis 2:12 4:12,12 9:6,6 11:1,1 (7)	mayor 2:9 4:6,9 9:1,3 10:21,23 (7)	negotiate 8:4 10:2
f 13:1	here 3:22 5:2	keefe 2:17 5:5,5	me 3:5,6	new 1:13 5:21 6:2,12,18,20 7:4,10,12,22 8:3 9:20 10:1 13:3,8 (15)
facilities 6:21	hereby 13:9	kenisha 2:11 4:15 8:18 9:8 10:14 11:3 (6)	meeting 1:2,10 3:8 4:1 6:8,25 7:18 11:13,15,19 12:1 (11)	next 6:10 7:2,20 9:18 (4)
fare 6:5	hereunto 13:16	known 8:6	member 8:13,16,20 10:9,12,16 (6)	no 8:8,15 10:11 13:14 (4)
ferc 3:2,24 6:8,25 7:18 11:21 (6)	historical 10:6	l 4:23	mental 11:24	noises 3:15
final 11:15	hosting 10:5	lauren 2:20 5:13	microphone 3:14	notary 1:12
first 5:18	hygiene 11:24	lefkowitz 2:20 5:13,13	microsoft 1:5 3:9	noted 12:13
fossella 5:15	i'd 3:4 12:5	levine 5:6	mirtha 2:14 4:22	now 4:1
franchise 1:3 3:25 5:24 6:1,15 7:7,25 9:23 (8)	inc 6:20 7:12 10:3	like 3:4 12:5	more 8:8	number 5:22 6:14 7:6,24 9:15,22 11:10 (7)
franchisee's 6:5	indexing 10:4	llc 8:5	motion 8:17,21 10:13,17 (4)	occupancy 8:4
further 13:12	information 9:21	lot 8:7	move 8:17,18 10:13,14 (4)	office 2:7,9 4:9,16 9:3,9 10:23 11:4 (8)
general 2:6	intent 5:23 6:14 7:6,24 9:22 (5)	made 11:14		
get 3:3	interested 13:14	maintenance 6:20 7:13,15		
gibson 4:23	internet 10:4			
given 3:17	into 6:19 7:11			
good 3:21	is 3:1,8,21,23 4:4 5:16 8:11,13 9:16 10:7,9 11:11,18,22 12:1 13:9 (16)			
great 12:10				

**In Re Public Meeting NYC - Mayor`s Office of Contract Services
(MOCS)**

June 8, 2022

16

one 3:16	2:13,15,16,18,19 4:20,23,24	record 3:11 11:15	second 8:21,22 10:17,18 (4)	10:10 13:10
only 3:16	5:2,3,6,7,10,11,14 9:13 11:8 (17)	records 9:21 10:6	section 6:16 7:8 8:1 9:24 (4)	staten 2:19 5:12,14
operation 6:21 7:13	presidents 9:13 11:8	recreation 6:13 7:5	seek 5:23 6:15 7:7,25 9:23 (5)	stewart 1:12 13:7
operations 10:3	private 6:3	regarding 5:25	selected 10:5	stoddart 2:3 3:20,21,23 4:7,7 5:16,17 6:9 7:1,19 8:11,12,16,20,23 9:2,2,17 10:7,8,12, 16,19,22,22 11:18,19 (28)
order 4:2	procedure 6:18 7:10 8:3 10:1 (4)	related 13:12	serve 11:23	storage 8:8
other 6:4	proceeding 11:16	remote 4:1 11:13	service 6:1 11:23	sutton 2:11 4:15,15 8:18,18 9:8,8 10:14,14 11:3,3 (11)
our 11:21	proceedings 3:4	remotely 1:5	services 7:23 9:21	swisher 2:18 5:9,9
outcome 13:15	property 8:6	reporter 11:12 13:8	serving 11:21,23	t 13:1,1
outdoor 7:14	proposed 5:25	request 6:6,23 7:16	set 13:16	take 8:24 10:20
over 6:7,24 7:17	public 1:2,10,12 4:1 6:8,25 7:18 11:13 (8)	resolution 9:16 11:11	sherman 6:21	taken 13:10
p 2:1,1	publication 10:5	response 8:15 10:11	shorthand 13:7	teams 1:5 3:9
park 7:14,15	publicly 11:14	review 1:3 3:25 5:24 6:15 7:7,25 9:23 (7)	should 3:16,18	term 6:22
parking 8:10	pursuant 6:16 7:8 8:1 9:24 (4)	richards 5:10	signature 13:20	than 8:8
parks 6:13 7:5	queens 2:18 5:8,9 13:5 (4)	role 11:22	skis 8:9	thank 3:20,22 5:16 6:9 7:1,19 8:11 9:17 11:20,25 12:3,3,7,8,9 (15)
part 11:15	question 8:14 10:10	roll 4:3	slip 7:14,15	their 3:10
parties 13:13	quintian 2:8 4:18,18 9:11,11 11:6,6 (7)	row 6:19	so 11:25 12:1	things 6:4
permit 8:4	r 2:1 13:1	rowing 6:21	sole 8:4 10:2	time 1:11 3:11,17 12:13 (4)
person 3:16 12:12	rahul 2:9 4:10 8:22 9:4 10:18,24 (6)	rules 6:17 7:9 8:2 9:25 (4)	source 8:4 10:2	today's 3:3,8
please 4:3 5:18 6:6,10,23 7:2,16,20 8:17,21,23 9:18 10:13,17,19 (15)	raise 6:4	s 2:1	speak 3:11	transcript 13:10
pleasure 12:5	ready 3:19	sabio 2:14 4:22,22	speaking 3:13,16	
pm 1:7 12:13	really 12:11	sabrina 1:12 13:7	ss 13:4	
present 4:8,10,13,15,19 (5)		say 11:20,25 12:5	stamoulis 2:6	
president			started 3:3	
			state 1:13 13:3,8	
			statement 8:14	

**In Re Public Meeting NYC - Mayor`s Office of Contract Services
(MOCS)**

June 8, 2022

17

transcription 3:12 transportation 5:22 6:3 true 13:9 uniform 6:5 use 6:20 utilize 6:18 7:10 8:3,5 10:1 (5) vanessa 4:23 very 12:4 via 1:5,11 3:9 video 1:11 vito 5:14 vote 8:24 10:20 want 11:20,25 waterfront 8:6 way 13:14 whereof 13:16 which 11:13 who 8:13 10:9 will 3:17 4:1,3 5:18 6:4,7,10,24 7:2,17,20 8:16,20,23 9:18 10:12,16,19 (18) wish 12:11 wishes 8:13 10:9 within 13:8,9 witness 13:16	working 12:6 x 1:1,4 year 12:10 yes 9:2,4,6,8,11,14 10:22,24 11:1,3,6,9 (12) yeses 3:7 york 1:13 5:21 6:2,12,18,20 7:4,10,12,22 8:3 9:20 10:1 13:3,8 (15) you're 3:13 your 3:14 12:7 yous 12:9 yvonne 2:8 4:18 9:11 11:6 (4) 235 1:7 244 12:13 2022 1:8 13:11,17 8844 8:7			
--	--	--	--	--